



**THE STATES assembled on Wednesday
20th October 2010, at 09.30 a.m. under
the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff,
William James Bailhache, Esquire.**

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Philip Francis Cyril Ozouf – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.35 a.m.)
Senator Frederick Ellyer Cohen – en défaut
Senator James Leslie Perchard – en défaut (défaut raised at 11.50 a.m.)
Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.35 a.m.)
Deputy Shona Pitman of St. Helier – ill
Deputy Deborah Jane De Sousa of St. Helier – ill

Prayers read by the Deputy Greffier of the States

Notification of lodged propositions

Social Security Fund: a new method of funding. P.154/2010.
Lodged: 20th October 2010.
Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier.

Withdrawal of lodged propositions

THE STATES noted that, in accordance with Standing Order 34(1), the proposer of the following proposition lodged “au Greffe” had informed the Greffier of the States that it had been withdrawn –

Reg’s Skips Limited – Planning Applications (R.118/2010): compensation and further P.130/2010.
action (P.130/2010) – second amendment. Amd.(2)
Lodged: 5th October 2010.
Senator F. du H. Le Gresley.

**Machinery of Government: establishment of Ministerial Boards and revised system of Scrutiny
P.120/2010**

THE STATES resumed consideration of the proposition of Senator Alan Breckon, as amended, concerning the establishment of Ministerial Boards and a revised system of Scrutiny.

THE STATES rejected the proposition –

- (a) that the current system of government in Jersey should be amended so that a more inclusive system was established with the aim of giving all States members greater opportunities to influence executive decision-making, and that to achieve this aim –

- (i) the current restriction on the total number of Assistant Ministers should be removed and all Ministers should have a Ministerial Board comprised of a minimum of 3 and a maximum of 5 members of the States;
 - (ii) the members of the Ministerial Boards should be elected and removed from office by the States;
 - (iii) Ministers should continue to be appointed by the States as at present, but the Chief Minister should be given the power to dismiss a Minister with the prior approval of a majority of the other Ministers;
 - (iv) Ministers should be required to consult with their Ministerial Boards at a properly constituted Board meeting, with minutes of the meeting recorded by an officer provided by the Greffier of the States, before taking significant Ministerial Decisions with the Boards operating in accordance with the procedures set out in Annex 1 to Appendix 1, except that for the third paragraph under the heading “Administrative arrangements and support” (which began with the words “The Boards will be supported”) there should be substituted the paragraph set out in the Appendix to the amendment of the Deputy of St. Peter dated 28th September 2010;
 - (v) the current system of 5 Scrutiny Panels with defined remits should be replaced by a more flexible overarching system of Scrutiny as set out in Annex 3 to Appendix 1 where topic Review Panels would be established by a Policy Review Committee to review individual matters of public interest, with all members other than Ministers and members of Ministerial Boards with responsibility for matters that were subject to the review able to participate in such panels;
- (b) to charge the Privileges and Procedures Committee, in consultation with the Council of Ministers, to take the necessary steps to bring forward the necessary legislation to give effect to the changes with a view to introducing the revised system in 2011 after the next ordinary elections.

Members present voted as follows –

POUR: 21

Senator T.A. Le Sueur
 Senator P.F. Routier
 Senator B.E. Shenton
 Senator J.L. Perchard
 Senator A. Breckon
 Senator S.C. Ferguson
 Connétable of St. Ouen
 Connétable of Grouville
 Connétable of St. Martin
 Connétable of St. Saviour
 Connétable of St. Peter
 Connétable of St. Lawrence
 Connétable of St. Mary
 Deputy J.B. Fox (H)
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)
 Deputy of Grouville
 Deputy of St. Peter
 Deputy P.V.F. Le Claire (H)

CONTRE: 28

Senator T.J. Le Main
 Senator A.J.H. Maclean
 Senator B.I. Le Marquand
 Senator F. du H. Le Gresley
 Connétable of St. Helier
 Connétable of Trinity
 Connétable of St. Brelade
 Connétable of St. John
 Connétable of St. Clement
 Deputy R.C. Duhamel (S)
 Deputy of St. Martin
 Deputy R.G. Le Hérisssier (S)
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)
 Deputy of St. Ouen
 Deputy J.A. Hilton (H)
 Deputy of Trinity
 Deputy S.S.P.A. Power (B)
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)

ABSTAIN: 1

Senator P.F.C. Ozouf

Deputy J.A.N. Le Fondré (L)
Deputy of St. John
Deputy T.A. Vallois (S)

Deputy I.J. Gorst (C)
Deputy M. Tadier (B)
Deputy A.E. Jeune (B)
Deputy of St. Mary
Deputy T.M. Pitman (H)
Deputy A.T. Dupré (C)
Deputy E.J. Noel (L)
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)
Deputy A.K.F. Green (H)
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)

Changes in Presidency

The Deputy Bailiff retired from the Chamber during consideration of the proposition of Senator Alan Breckon (P.120/2010 entitled ‘Machinery of Government: establishment of Ministerial Boards and revised system of Scrutiny’) and the meeting continued under the presidency of Mr. Michael Nelson de la Haye, Greffier of the States until the lunch adjournment. The States re-assembled after the lunch adjournment under the Presidency of the Deputy Bailiff.

Removal of name from transcript of the meeting (Official Report, ‘Hansard’)

During consideration of the proposition of Senator Alan Breckon (P.120/2010 entitled ‘Machinery of Government: establishment of Ministerial Boards and revised system of Scrutiny’), the Deputy Bailiff reminded Members that Standing Order 104(2)(i) stated that “a member of the States must not ... (i) refer to any individual who is not a member of the States by name, unless use of the individual’s name is unavoidable and of direct relevance to the business being discussed”. He therefore ruled that the use of names in this way was disorderly, and in accordance with Standing Orders 109(7) and 160(3A) directed that certain names so used during the course of the debate be omitted from the transcript of the meeting.

Adjournment

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Thursday 21st October 2010 to consider the outstanding items of public business.

THE STATES rose at 5.43 p.m.

A.H. HARRIS

Deputy Greffier of the States